

CITY OF SONOMA
DESIGN REVIEW AND HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
October 18, 2016
Community Meeting Room, 177 First Street West, Sonoma, CA
MINUTES

Chair Randolph called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.

Present: Chair Randolph, Comms. Barnett, Tippell, Johnson, Cory (Alternate)

Absent: Comm. Essert

Others Present: Associate Planner Atkins, Administrative Assistant Morris

Chair Randolph stated that no new items would be heard after 10:30 p.m. unless the Design Review and Historic Preservation Commission so decides. Any decisions made tonight can be appealed within 15 days to the City Council. She reminded everyone to turn off cell phones and pagers. Comm. McDonald led the Pledge of Allegiance.

COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC: None

Correspondence: Late mail was received on Item #1 from Joan Jennings and Steven Moseley.

Item 1- Continued Landscape Review- Consideration of a landscape plan for two commercial buildings at 19366 and 19370 Sonoma Highway.

Applicant: Studio 101 Designs

Associate Planner Atkins presented staff's report.

Steven Mosley, Studio 101 Designs, said Henry Fleischman, landscape Architect and Alicia Razzari, Kibby Road LLC. Developer/property owner were available to answer questions.

Henry Flesichman, landscape Architect, said the Callery pear trees were selected to provide screening and privacy for neighbors. The trellis plantings will provide an additional buffer.

Comm. Barnett confirmed with the landscape architect that the property to the west is maintained by the developer and the east side is the HOA/individual property owners' obligation.

Chair Randolph opened the item to public comment.

Joan Jennings, resident, appreciated the collaboration between the planning staff and developer's project team to help resolve the HOA residents' concerns.

Nick Dolata, neighbor/ HOA Board President, is satisfied with the Callery pear tree. He agreed with Joan Jennings that a lot of progress was made.

Jack Ding, resident, supported the proposal.

Chair Randolph closed the item to public comment.

Comm. Tippell is pleased with the positive outcome and fully endorsed the new design.

Comms. Johnson and Barnett concurred with Comm. Tippell and are satisfied with the end result.

Comm. Cory offered no additional comments and is “happy it is over”.

Comm. Tippell made a motion to approve the landscape plan for two commercial buildings at 19366 and 19370 Sonoma Highway as submitted. Comm. Johnson seconded. The motion carried unanimously (5-0).

Item 2- Continued Design Review- Consideration of site design and architectural review of an addition to a residence at 277 Fourth Street East.

Applicant: Sutton Suzuki Architects

Associate Planner Atkins presented staff’s report.

Chair Randolph opened the item to public comment.

Ron Sutton, Sutton Suzuki Architects, received no negative feedback from the neighbors.

Cara Brunzell, Historic consultant, was available to answer any questions.

Chair Randolph closed the item to public comment.

Comms. Cory and Tippell supported the proposal.

Comm. Barnett agreed with Comm. Cory and appreciated the clarification provided by the applicant and Architect.

Comm. Johnson agreed with his fellow commissioners.

Chair Randolph believed the proposed renovations are a vast improvement and agreed with Comm. Barnett’s comments.

Comm. Barnett made a motion to approve the site design and architectural review of an addition to a residence at 277 Fourth Street East. Comm. Cory seconded. The motion carried unanimously (5-0).

Item 3- Sign Review- Consideration of two refaced freestanding signs at 550 Second Street West.

Applicant: David Ford

Associate Planner Atkins presented staff’s report.

Comm. Johnson confirmed with staff that the tower sign is illuminated.

Chair Randolph opened the item to public comment.

David Ford, applicant, said the only change to the two tower signs is prefacing.

Comm. Barnett preferred the original sign (local) since he felt the new sign (corporate) will be too bright.

Comm. Tippell confirmed with the applicant the dark navy blue color.

Chair Randolph said the existing sign is internally illuminated.

Comm. Barnett asked the applicant if there was flexibility on their part.

Neil Colwell, Well Design, disclosed he bid for the job. He felt the tower and monument sign proposed is out of scale/compliance.

Chair Randolph closed the item to public comment.

Comm. Tippell preferred a darker navy blue color instead of royal blue.

Comm. Johnson recognized the importance of national branding for the Best Western but did not endorse the sign changes.

Comm. Barnett agreed with Neil Colwell and echoed his fellow commissioner's comments. He stressed the importance of maintaining the Sonoma Valley Inn name to preserve the small town character of Sonoma. He recommended a "classy monument sign".

Comm. Cory agreed with his fellow commissioners that more choices should be considered.

Chair Randolph asked David Ford if he thought Best Western corporate might consider changes to the application.

David Ford received enough feedback to report back about other options for the monument sign.

Comm. Barnett recommended more sign options and suggested looking at other examples of Best Western signage from comparable historic small towns.

Comm. Johnson confirmed with David Ford that the illegal banners will be removed.

Comm. Tippell made a motion to consider tonight's meeting a study session. The applicants will return with options using different materials for the monument sign and the clock tower signage is fine as submitted. Comm. Johnson seconded. The motion carried unanimously (5-0).

Item 4- Sign Review- Consideration of a projecting sign and a wall sign for a restaurant (Slice Shack) at 8 West Spain Street.

Applicant: Well Design

Associate Planner Atkins presented staff's report.

Chair Randolph confirmed with staff that the existing sign was not approved as a temporary sign through the Planning Department.

Chair Randolph opened the item to public comment.

Neil Colwell, Well Design, suggested that the lettering is different coloring than indicated in the staff report. The proposed sign had internal LED dimmable controls.

Comm. Barnett questioned whether similar solid panel signs exist in the Plaza District.

Comm. Cory questioned the hours of Mary's restaurant since the primary business sign might provide enough visibility. He opposed the sign.

Ron Wellander, resident, was "intrigued with the spirited dialogue" about illuminated signs. He recommended the approval of the signage on a temporary basis.

Chair Randolph closed the item to public comment.

Comm. Barnett is not persuaded to approve on a temporary basis. He agreed with Comm. Cory that reverse illuminated signs on the Plaza might not be appropriate.

Comm. Tippell liked the sign and is comfortable granting on a temporary basis.

Comm. Johnson disagreed with approving illuminated signs on the Plaza since it would set a precedent.

Comm. Cory felt the business might exceed the allowable number of signs for the ownership.

Chair Randolph felt the sign conveyed a warm and friendly feel. She was encouraged with the dimming option.

Neil Colwell explained that the sign concept was intended to provide a directional glow and will be the same size as the temporary sign. He appreciated Ron Wellander's comments and the DRHPC discussion.

Comm. Johnson felt sign consistency is important on the Square and he did not agree with temporary signage.

Comm. Barnett is concerned with the sign illumination.

Comm. Barnett made a motion to deny the projecting sign and a wall sign for a restaurant (Slice Shack) at 8 West Spain Street. Comm. Cory seconded. The motion carried unanimously (5-0).

Item 5- Sign Review- Consideration of a wall sign and a window sign for a commercial building (Edward Jones) at 463 Second Street West.

Applicant: Barber Sign Company, Inc.

Associate Planner Atkins presented staff's report.

Chair Randolph opened the item to public comment.

Robert Rogers, representing Barber Sign Company, Inc., said the signage is needed for better visibility for the clientele that he referred to as "the older generation".

No public comment

Chair Randolph closed the item to public comment.

Comms. Cory, Barnett, Tippell supported.

Comm. Johnson agreed with his fellow commissioners based on the set back location.

Chair Randolph agreed with her fellow commissioners and approved.

Comm. Johnson made a motion to approve the wall sign and a window sign for a commercial building (Edward Jones) at 463 Second Street West. Comm. Tippell seconded. The motion carried unanimously (5-0).

Item 6- Design Review- Consideration of new paint colors for a commercial building (Rancho Maria Family Vineyards) at 481 First Street West.

Applicant: Rancho Maria Family Vineyards

Associate Planner Atkins presented staff's report.

Chair Randolph opened the item to public comment.

Sebastian Juarez, applicant, said the building needed a fresh coat of paint and sealing.

Patricia Cullinan, resident, questioned the choice of colors.

Chair Randolph closed the item to public comment.

Comms. Tippell, Johnson and Barnett liked the new paint colors.

Comm. Tippell made a motion to approve the proposal as submitted with the suggestion that the entire soffit incorporate the Baja dunes color and the entire door feature the night horizon color for a commercial building (Rancho Maria Family Vineyards) at 481 First Street West.

Item 6- Design Review- Design Review of proposed alterations and an addition to a residence at 579 First Street East

Applicant: Robert Baumann

Associate Planner Atkins presented staff's report.

Chair Randolph opened the item to public comment.

Robert Baumann, project Architect, introduced the project team; Michael Garavaglia, Garavaglia Architecture Inc., (restoration technics) and Tom Thornley, Thornley Associates (General Contractor). He said the owner's goal is to maintain the purity of the space within the old adobe historic residence.

Comm. Barnett clarified that civil engineers need to make a proposal to the Building Department.

Chair Randolph asked for a description of the intended use.

Robert Baumann explained the new owners will raise their family and entertain friends in the indoor/outdoor living space.

Comm. Johnson inquired about the tree removal process and correcting a non-conforming condition.

Prema Behan, Interim President of the League of Historic Preservation/resident, supported the preservation efforts and said the Board has no position until they have an opportunity to review the proposal.

Patricia Cullinan, resident, read a letter from local Architect, Victor Conforti about a concern that dormer #10 could cause damage to the stucco of this valuable historic resource. She requested a thorough analysis of the demolition plan by the Building Official to ensure compliance.

George McKale, resident/registered archeologist, offered his services. He is concerned with the construction disturbing the historic integrity of the site.

Robert Baumann agreed with Patricia Cullinan that mud plaster should be used for historic walls.

Michael Garavaglia, Garavaglia Architecture Inc., prepared the Historic Resource Evaluation (HRE) for the site and said he is not familiar with the specific local guidelines in regards to requiring archeological studies. He said the owners are stewards of the this well-known California Historic Landmark # 667 within the City's Historic Overlay Zone.

Chair Randolph closed the item to public comment.

Comm. Barnett is concerned with the implications of structural changes.

Comm. Tippell is satisfied with the rustic materials used for the transition to the new addition.

Comm. Johnson is pleased with the constructive comments and design elements of the project.

Comm. Barnett is impressed with the caliber of the design/construction team led/selected by Robert Baumann.

Comm. Cory concurred with Comm. Barnett's comments.

Chair Randolph appreciated the complete application and valued the team approach.

Comm. Barnett made a motion to approve the proposal as submitted with the following conditions of approval: demolition methods for the removal of the existing addition shall be subject to staff approval and submitted in conjunction with the Building Permit application to confirm that the demolition methods are consistent with the Secretary of Interior Standards. It is recommended that a preliminary archeology study be performed prior to any ground breaking activities. The Building and Planning department shall work together with the applicant to ensure that the project complies with the Secretary of Interior Standards throughout the project. Comm. Johnson seconded. The motion carried unanimously (5-0).

Item #8-Public Hearing Review of Draft Model Water Efficient Landscape Ordinance.

Associate Planner Atkins presented staff's report.

Associate Planner Atkins outlined some changes to include a reduction in the ET factor, minimum size of 500 square feet, more documents needed for landscape projects and administrative review for housing projects.

Comm. Barnett confirmed with Associate Planner Atkins that the Green Building Code is followed and the project water estimations are part of the plan check review process.

Chair Randolph opened the item to public comment.

Tamra Honeybourne, resident, questioned the turf restrictions.

Associate Planner Atkins responded that water conservation efforts include the City's turf rebate program for front lawns.

Ron Wellander, resident, is very interested in the revised ordinance and revisiting the process. He applauded Associate Planner Atkin's efforts/input and recommended a workshop to elicit more discussions in regards to monitoring efficient water use; i.e. water calculations, checks/balances with in the processes. He suggested that backyards could be included in the review of allowable consumption for homeowners.

Chair Randolph closed the item to public comment.

Comm. Barnett agreed that a workshop forum would be helpful. He noted that the City's water efficient landscaping example along Highway 12 (near Staples) could be improved.

Issues Update:

Comments from the Commission:

Adjournment: Chair Randolph made a motion to adjourn at 9:48 p.m. to the next regular meeting scheduled for Tuesday, November 15, 2016.

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the foregoing minutes were duly and regularly adopted at a regular meeting of the Design Review and Historic Preservation Commission on the 20th day of December 2016.

Approved:

Cristina Morris, Administrative Assistant