

**CITY OF SONOMA
DESIGN REVIEW AND HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
January 20, 2015
Community Meeting Room, 177 First Street West, Sonoma, CA
MINUTES**

Chair Barnett called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Chair Barnett, Comms. Randolph, Tippell, Anderson, McDonald, Johnson
Absent:
Others Associate Planner Atkins, Senior Planner Gjestland, Administrative
Present: Assistant Morris

Chair Barnett stated that no new items would be heard after 10:30 p.m. unless the Design Review and Historic Preservation Commission so decides. Any decisions made tonight can be appealed within 15 days to the City Council. He reminded everyone to turn off cell phones and pagers.

COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC: Rachel Hundley, City Councilmember, expressed her interest in Historic Preservation issues and appreciated the dedication of committee members and staff.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: Comm. Randolph made a motion to approve the Minutes of December 17, 2014 as submitted. Comm. McDonald seconded. The motion was unanimously approved.

CHANGES TO AGENDA ORDER: Meek Shelf, Sonoma Wine and Cheese, requested a change in the agenda order change to move Item #7 forward because several business merchants were already in attendance.

Mary Martinez, resident, disagreed with changing the agenda order since it could set a precedent. Comm. Anderson made a motion to discuss Item 7 after Item 2. The motion was unanimously approved.

CORRESPONDENCE: Late mail was received for Items 1, 4 and 7.

Item #1 – Consideration of two wall signs for a restaurant (B & V Whiskey Bar & Grille) at 400 First Street East.

Applicant: Codi Binkley

Associate Planner Atkins presented staff's report.

Comm. Anderson confirmed with Staff that all the signs are approved.

Comm. Randolph inquired about a change in the menu style.

Codi Binkley, business owner, proposed a casual dining experience during the day with a more upscale menu offered at night.

Comm. Anderson clarified with the applicant that the daily menu displayed will be featured in a secured glass box with two keys.

Chair Barnett opened the item to public comment.

Mary Martinez, resident, felt the sign application is incomplete and should not be reviewed as presented.

Robert Ryan, commercial tenant, is satisfied with the proposal and commended the applicant for being supportive and a “good neighbor”.

Dawn Marmaduke, Grandma Linda’s Ice Cream, is pleased with the process in place for approving new signs.

Chair Barnett closed the item to public comment.

Comm. McDonald is satisfied with the proposed changes to the business yet remained concerned with the sign’s illumination and the mounting on the historic building. He did not oppose a variance.

Comm. Tippell supported the wall sign and new logo as a business improvement.

Comm. Randolph cautiously reviewed the proposal because a previously approved sign did not appear/reflect what she expected/envisioned.

Comm. Anderson reminded the Commission and public that there was a cork board and he could visualize the concept for the new sign.

Chair Barnett echoed some of the many comments made from his fellow commissioners and the public and supported.

Chair Barnett re-opened the public comment.

Codi Binkley stated that their lighting has not changed since 1983.

Comm. Anderson confirmed with the applicant that incremental approvals are acceptable so the menu board could be approved and the font size lettering could be decided by the Commission or Staff at a future date.

Chair Barnett closed the item to public comment.

Comm. McDonald made a motion to approve the application as submitted with the condition that any changes to the font, size, lighting, or orientation of the sign shall be brought back to the DRHPC. The approval applies to the illuminated wall sign and the menu board wall sign. Comm. Anderson seconded. The motion was unanimously approved.

Item #2 – Consideration of a trash enclosure area for a restaurant (El Dorado Kitchen) at 405 First Street West at 405 First Street West.

Applicant: Treg Finney

Associate Planner Atkins presented staff’s report.

Chair Barnett opened the item to public comment.

Treg Finney, applicant, said the enclosure will give the appearance of a fence when closed.

Comm. Anderson confirmed the metal framing will be flush with the building.

Chair Barnett closed the item to public comment.

Comm. McDonald thanked the applicant for making the recommended changes.

Comms. Tippell, Randolph, Anderson and Chair Barnett supported the proposal.

Comm. McDonald made a motion to follow the rolling gate frame design and materials baton board frames.
Comm. Tippell seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

Comm. McDonald made a motion to change 7 to Item 3.

Item- Discussion and review of sign regulations related to portable freestanding signs.

Laurie Decker Economic Coordinator/Chamber of Commerce “got the word out” about the discussion tonight regarding displaying signs on the sidewalks in the alleyways. She mentioned that Sonoma Court Shops has an approved sign program in place.

Comm. Randolph appreciated staff’s packet in particular the “historical” discussion.

Chair Barnett opened the item to public comment.

Jeanette Fung, Sox & Vine, business owner in an alleyway across from the Plaza said it is sometimes difficult for customers to find the business and the portable signs are beneficial.

Meekk Shelf, thanked the commission for moving the item forward and working with Burgers and Vine. In her opinion, alleyway signs are valuable since businesses often find it challenging to attract customers. She believed the City should be more accommodating in this regard.

Robert Ryan, business owner on an alleyway agreed. He often hears visitors say “don’t miss the alleyways”. He appreciated the well maintained streets and the diversity of the storeowners on the Plaza streets being maintained and ADA compliant.

Ryan Cooper, Sonoma Wine Shop, supported other small businesses efforts to remain unique and friendly.

Dawn Marmaduke, felt the sign regulations limit her business and some are not applicable. She resented having received a letter from the City to remove the sign or pay a fine.

Chair Barnett closed the item to public comment.

Comm. Anderson questioned if alleyways or streets are differentiated in the sign applications and felt a bigger concern is signage along the Caltrans right of ways. He appreciated innovative and the artistic nature of the local signs.

Comm. Randolph summarized:

1. Small businesses want signs.

2. Costs for professional signs.
3. Support small business.
4. Simpler sign process.

Comm. Tippell suggested uniform and standardized signs options.

Comm. McDonald is pleased with the sign program around the Plaza. He wants more flexibility for business signage in the Sonoma Alleyways, (Private property owner will dictate-empowering the property owner with guidelines from the City. He agreed with his other Commissioners that the design will resolve itself.

Chair Barnett agreed that more flexibility for signage in alleyways should be considered. He agreed with Comm. McDonald but thinks a couple options may be too generic. He agreed that consistency is important,

Comm. McDonald summarized that commissioners agreed to allow standardized signs in alleyways, with property owner approval.

Comm. Anderson appreciated the public comment about seasonal signs.

Comm. McDonald motioned to continue the item to a future meeting to allow staff to provide examples of portable freestanding signs that could be approved administratively.

Item #4 – Consideration of design review for a Vacation rental and office building at 20079 Broadway

Applicant/Property Owner: William Welch

Associate Planner Atkins presented staff's report.

Comm. Anderson confirmed the approval for the vacation rental is for two rooms.

Chair Barnett opened the item to public comment.

William Welch, new property owner, is proposing an office and having a vacation rental that he feels is a better use for the building.

Comm. McDonald confirmed with the applicant the reason for changing the windows was the noise factor. He is concerned with the signage possibility of having an office use. He felt glazing is more inviting.

Fred O'Donnell, Figo Design, received the building approvals a year ago and is revising the scope of the project adding more parking spaces in the back.

Chair Barnett closed the item to public comment.

Comm. Tippell appreciated the modern design and she agreed with Comm. McDonald That the windows should be modified.

Comm. Randolph liked the changes made.

Comm. Anderson supported but likes the original cherry wood door.

Chair Barnett supported the proposal and is pleased that there will be a use for the space. More glass is beneficial.

Comm. McDonald suggested that lowering windows allowing more natural light to enter is beneficial for rental spaces,

Comm. Randolph said different windows will change the geometry of the building.

Comm. Anderson made a motion to approve the submittal as submitted. Comm. Randolph seconded. The motion carried 3-2. (Comm. McDonald and Chair Barnett opposed.)

Item #5 -Consideration of design review of proposed alterations to a residence at 116 Chase Street.

Applicant/Property Owner: Chad Overway

Associate Planner Atkins presented staff's report.

Chair Barnett opened the item to public comment.

Chad Overway and Jean Overway, applicants and property owners, were available to answer questions.

Comm. Anderson inquired if the window replacements will be same size wood windows,

Chris Brown, neighbor on the west side stated his main concern was with height of the building. He confirmed with staff that the setback is five feet and the new addition met the setback requirements.

Senior Planner Gjestland stated that an accessory structure does not require design review,

Joe Aaron, neighbor, supported the proposal.

Karen Collins, neighbor, supported the project and appreciated the efforts of the DRHPC to maintain the neighborhood integrity.

Chair Barnett closed the item to public comment.

Comm. Anderson is pleased with the preservation and restoration of the home.

Comm. Tippell congratulated the owners on the restoration.

Comm. McDonald and Chair Barnett appreciated the attention to details.

Comm. McDonald made a motion to approve the proposal as submitted with the following conditions of approval: 1) the final garage door selection shall be reviewed by the historic evaluator, Juliana Inman, for consistency; and 2) photographs of the interior of the residence (taken prior to any demolition) shall be provided to the Sonoma League for Historic Preservation. In addition, the DRHPC recommended that the dog-eared element on the porch be removed.

Chair Barnett called a five minute recess.

Item #6- Consideration of building elevations, exterior colors, materials, lighting, and landscaping for an 18 unit Planned Development at 821-845 West Spain Street.

Applicant: Ledson Development

Senior Planner Gjestland presented staff's report.

The City Council upheld the Planning Commission decision but requested a modification to Lot 3.

Chair Barnett opened the item to public comment.

Comm. McDonald is very pleased with the housing projects. He requested clarification on the utilities, landscaping, and water meters around the side of the units and screened by the landscaping,

Bill Reinhart, Landscaper/Civil Engineer, is impressed that Steve Ledson mentioned utilities for the site upon his first site visit.

Steve Ledson, applicant, confirmed that the mailboxes will be clustered.

Comm. Tippell questioned the architect about the color selections.

Bob Buckner, color consultant, will use the same color palette used in the West MacArthur Street subdivision.

Chair Barnett closed the item to public comment.

Comm. McDonald confirmed with Staff that landscaping will be reviewed by the Planning Director and the City Attorney. He recommended utilities to be reviewed as part of the landscaping plan.

Comms. Tippell and Randolph were impressed with the level of details in the landscaping plan.

Comm. Anderson is satisfied with the quality of construction in the Ledson Homes.

Chair Barnett commended the project team and said that the West MacArthur subdivision is a good opportunity for first time homebuyers.

Comm. McDonald made a motion to approve the site plan subject to COA that include CCRs to include perimeter trees and staff review of the final utility plan. Comm. Anderson seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

6- Consideration of building elevation details, exterior color and materials, and outdoor lighting for a mixed-use building (CocoaPlanet) located 921 Broadway.

Comm. Anderson recused due to proximity and left the room. Comm. Johnson came to the dais.

Associate Planner Atkins presented staff report.

Chair Barnett opened the public comment.

Tom Anderson, project Architect, described the project.

Anne McKibben, property owner, choose a muted blue color for the roof and natural stones.

Chair Barnett closed the item to public comment.

Comm. McDonald is pleased with the proposal and felt it will help upgrade this section of Broadway. His only reservation is the blue roof color.

Comms. Tippell, Randolph and Johnson concurred with Comm. McDonald but would like the roof color toned down.

Anne McKibben agreed with the Commissioners and will explore other color options for the roof.

Comm. McDonald made a motion to approve the project as submitted including the standing seam metal roof with the condition that the final color sample of the roof come back to the DRHPC with several options that are consistent with the corrugated metal siding, fenestration, window systems, and slate. In addition, a landscape plan shall be reviewed at a later date Comm. Randolph seconded. The motion was unanimously approved.

Comments from the Audience:

Chair Barnett made a motion to adjourn.

Adjournment: The meeting adjourned at 10:47 p.m. to the next regular meeting scheduled for 6:30 p.m. on Tuesday, February 17, 2015.

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the foregoing minutes were duly and regularly adopted at a regular meeting of the Design Review and Historic Preservation Commission on the 16th day of February 2016

Approved:

Cristina Morris, Administrative Assistant