

**CITY OF SONOMA
DESIGN REVIEW AND HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
March 15, 2016
Community Meeting Room, 177 First Street West, Sonoma, CA
MINUTES**

Chair Randolph called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Chair Randolph, Comms. Tippell, Johnson, Essert, Cory (Alternate)

Absent: Comm. Barnett

Others Present: Associate Planner Atkins, Administrative Assistant Morris

Chair Randolph stated that no new items would be heard after 10:30 p.m. unless the Design Review and Historic Preservation Commission so decides. Any decisions made tonight can be appealed within 15 days to the City Council. She reminded everyone to turn off cell phones and pagers.

COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC: None

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: Comm. Johnson made a motion to approve the minutes of February 16, 2016. Comm. Tippell seconded. The motion carried unanimously 4-0 (Comm. Cory abstained)

CHANGES TO AGENDA: None

CORRESPONDENCE: Late mail was received on Item 1

Comm. Tippell recused due to financial interest and left the dais.

Item 1- Consideration of design review of three vacation rentals and a duplex at 158, 164, 166 and 172 West Napa Street.

Applicant: Michael Marino

Associate Planner Atkins presented the staff report.

Chair Randolph opened the item to public comment.

Michael Marino, resident/business owner California Wine Tours/vacation rental operator (850 Broadway) intended to remodel the Historic Hawker House preserving the historic elements that can be retained. He clarified with staff and the DRHPC that Monterey White is the proposed paint color not Montgomery white as indicated in the staff report. The duplex is proposed for a long term rental not a vacation rental.

Comms. Johnson and Cory visited the site.

Kevin Dixon, project architect/contractor, aimed to retain the original shape of the building by building from the inside out. He hoped to strike a balance between the architecture and construction.

Leslie Tippell, color specialist, confirmed that a glazing specialist will preserve the original windows and the trim color is Monterey white. The Benjamin Moore historic colors compliment the details of the original Hawker House. The new roof is composition shingles. She recognized the historic Hawker House is the focal point so as many historical elements as possible will be preserved and continued throughout.

Comm. Essert confirmed with the color specialist that the exterior of the Millgard windows will be painted black.

Comm. Cory inquired about suggestions he made to the applicant about the thickness of the roof shingles. He felt that a thinner roof material would be more period appropriate.

Leslie Tippell indicated that the applicant would be open to considering a thinner roof material and would like approval for both options..

Kevin Dixon, project architect/contractor envisioned the three roofs incorporating different textures.

Comm. Cory is disappointed that the three houses will have the same roof materials even though the colors will be different. He recommended that the roofing materials for the historic Hawker House be more period appropriate and the roof material should be flat. He also objected to the roofing material and the garage door on the duplex. He felt the style of the garage door is overused and suggested using plywood with trim instead. On 164 West Napa Street he felt that two different styles were being used on the face of the building and that the style of the house did not call for a mansard roof. He also did not support the picture window. On 172 West Napa he objected to the lights on the French doors being a different size than on the windows and he did not feel that a picture window was appropriate.

Michael Marino said that when he applied for the Building Permit for the Hawker House the only Planning requirement was to replace the roof material in-kind. He would like the option to explore either thickness for the roofing material.

Comm. Essert stressed that CEQA guidelines must be followed. He inquired whether restoration or recycled glass will be used in in the windows. Michael Marino stated that the original window glass and the design material will be replaced with like kind.

Patricia Cullinan, resident, complimented the owner and project team for their efforts and hoped that the Secretary of Interior standards might be better clarified for future projects. She added that a historic preservation design professional could give better guidance on the roofing material.

Robert Demler, resident/west side property owner is satisfied with the proposed changes for the site and viewed nice enhancement and viewed as an improvement to the West side of town.

Chair Randolph closed the item to public comment.

Comm. Johnson is satisfied with the owner's experience remodeling homes.

Comm. Essert echoed the comments from public and felt the scale is appropriate. He appreciated reusing the bricks under the window sills. He suggested that the bay window and copper roof on 172 West Napa Street does not effectively represent the time period and he suggested placing a grill on the window to block the view from the gas station. He commented that black paint on the window trim is attractive but challenging to maintain. He stated that restoration glass is preferred for the replacement windows. Finally, he recommended that the applicant consult with a historical consultant for roof material.

Comm. Cory is concerned with the Hawker House since it has been placed on the National Register and requested that it be kept as authentic as possible.

Chair Randolph agreed with her fellow commissioner comments that the attention to detail is impressive in the plan.

Comm. Essert made a motion to approve the project as submitted with the condition that the applicant consult with a historic consultant to ensure the roof material for 158 West Spain Street is period appropriate. Comm. Johnson seconded. The motion carried unanimously (4-0)

Commissioner Comments:

Issues Update: Associate Planner Atkins reported the following;
A webinar on Historic building codes will be held on March 23rd at the City Hall conference room.

Comments from the Audience:

Comments from the Commission:

Adjournment: Chair Randolph made a motion to adjourn at 7:45 p.m. to the next regular meeting scheduled for 6:30 p.m. on Tuesday, April 26, 2016. The motion carried unanimously.

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the foregoing minutes were duly and regularly adopted at a regular meeting of the Design Review and Historic Preservation Commission on the 17th day of May 2016.

Approved:

Cristina Morris, Administrative Assistant