

**CITY OF SONOMA
DESIGN REVIEW AND HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
March 18, 2014**

Community Meeting Room, 177 First Street West, Sonoma, CA

MINUTES

Chair Tippell called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Chair Tippell, Comms. Anderson, Barnett, McDonald, Randolph,
Johnson (Alternate)
Absent:
Others Planning Director Goodison, Associate Planner Atkins, Administrative
Present: Assistant Morris

Chair Tippell stated that no new items would be heard after 10:30 p.m. unless the Design Review Historic Preservation Commission so decides. Any decisions made tonight can be appealed within 15 days to the City Council. She reminded everyone to turn off cell phones and pagers.

COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC: Michael Palmer, project Architect Pet Food Express, requested to consolidate Items #3 & #7 (Item # 7 moved to Item #4).

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: Comm. Barnett made a motion to approve the minutes of February 18, 2014 with the changes noted. Comm. McDonald seconded. The motion carried unanimously. Comm. McDonald made a motion to approve the minutes of February 26, 2014. Comm. Barnett seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

CHANGES TO AGENDA ORDER: Item # 7 to Item #4 after Item #3 Chair Tippell made a motion to approve the changes to the Agenda Item order-Item #7 to Item #4 after Item #3. Comm. Randolph seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

CORRESPONDENCE: Late mail was received regarding Items #2, #8 and #9 and correspondence about Grandma Linda's Ice cream shop.

Item #1–Public Hearing–Discussion Item Review of the changes related to Certified Local Government and recent Municipal Code revisions.

Planning Director Goodison presented staff's report.

Chair Tippell opened the item to public comment.

Karla Noyes, resident, requested that funding for the Certified Local Government program be used to develop a selected palette of colors for the owners of the Historic Buildings in Sonoma. She also requested that the Commission consider adopting an ordinance that regulates demolition by neglect.

Loyce Heron, resident, is pleased that training is provided for the Commissioners and thanked Planning Director Goodison for obtaining this opportunity through the Certified Local Government program.

Mary Martinez, resident, confirmed with Planning Director Goodison that money is budgeted through the Certified Local Government for Commissioner educational training.

Comm. Barnett clarified that from the City's perspective the definition of Historic buildings are structures older than 1945.

Planning Director Goodison noted that the recent changes were made after a long process. The 1945 date was drawn as an unchanging line and should be reviewed again.

Comm. McDonald is concerned with the existing Historic District and boundary in regards to planning review of projects. He suggested taking a "discerning look" and a "broad analysis" of the City to identify the unique/particular characteristics of certain neighborhoods. (i.e. Overlay District). He recommended a criteria check list then a peer analysis for projects in the Historic District so the historic resource is not negatively affected.

Planning Director Goodison noted that the "bigger issue" of the City Historic overlay zone encompassed a variety of infill projects in the Historic Preservation area. He suggested identifying discreet districts. The Historic Overlay Zone is not a zoning district. He believes that although Comm. McDonald's idea is good it might be hard to implement.

Comm. McDonald confirmed with staff that the Historic Overlay Zone includes properties over 50 years old.

Comm. McDonald recommended using an independent consulting firm to review projects before consideration by the Design Review and Historic Preservation Commission.

Planning Director Goodison stated that staff does an independent analysis therefore it is not necessary to hire an outside consultant.

Comm. Randolph thanked staff for the comprehensive report.

Planning Director Goodison stated that at the April DRHPC meeting a staff report will be prepared discussing the implementation measures in the recently adopted Historic Preservation Plan, and the DRHPC should determine the top three projects it would like the City Council to consider funding in the 2014/2015 budget.

The Certified Local Government is a process that included State endorsed policies followed by the City of Sonoma today.

Comm. Barnett recalled that the Certified Local Government was introduced in July of 2010 as an informational item. He is pleased that training is available for Commissioners. He supported demolition by neglect and is opposed to a color palette for the buildings around the Plaza because he felt there is already an effective approach for determining the color schemes.

Chair Tippell closed the item to public comment.

Item #2–Discussion Item–Review possible policy changes with regard to historic evaluations.

Planning Director Goodison presented staff's report.

Chair Tippell opened the item to public comment.

Mary Martinez, resident, spoke on behalf of Patricia Cullinan and supported making the necessary policy changes for evaluations of Historic District properties. She felt that Comms. Barnett and McDonald fully understood the concerns and noted that Santa Barbara and Pasadena offered resources for the City as local municipalities with the Certified Local Government designation.

Comm. Barnett appreciated having the City's Certified Local Government designation in place.

Comm. McDonald wanted future applicants to verbalize in their evaluations the impacts upon Historic resources.

Comm. Anderson suggested that there are legal ramifications of having a report done and confirmed with staff that the property owner's consent is not required although there may be impacts of having the study completed.

Chair Tippell closed the item to public comment.

Item #3–Public Hearing–Continued Design and Review Consideration of external building modifications and a modification to a sign program for a commercial business (Pet Food Express) at 500 West Napa Street Suites 502-510

Applicant/Property Owner: McCall Design Group

Associate Planner Atkins presented staffs report

Chair Tippell opened the item to public comment.

Michael Palmer, Architect, noted that he had made significant changes to the proposal i.e. reduced glazing. In July 2012, the Design Review and Historic Preservation Commission approved an application for a new paint scheme, landscape plan, and signage program for the Sonoma Valley Center.

Mr. Mayloye, mid-anchor size tenant, said the sign reflected conformity with the existing Sonoma Market sign.

Comms. Barnett and McDonald agreed with the 32 foot long sign for the business.

Chair Tippell confirmed with the sign vendor that the sign will match the existing tile roofing.

Comm. Randolph noted the framework for the sign is existing.

David Asajan, Sign Company representative stated that every Pet Food Express location follows the shopping centers and City regulations.

Comm. McDonald is concerned with the sign changing the look of the shopping center and confirmed with the applicant that the proposal is a structure with a change to the look of the shopping center.

Comm. Barnett disagreed with having a menu of services listed on the sign.

Comms. McDonald and Randolph agreed that the sign details preserved the “villagy look of the center”.

Comm. Anderson clarified that the roof is behind the wall.

Nancy King, Executive Director Pets Lifeline, supported Pet Food Express in Sonoma since they contributed to shelters in the community.

Karla Noyes, resident, is of the opinion that the sign is overbearing and does not fit the location.

Marcela Vanilla, shopping center tenant, supported the Pet Food Express.

Carol Davis, Pet Food Express employee, explained that the advertising campaign for the store included a promotional photo session with a customer’s pet.

Comm. Barnett confirmed with staff that the window standards apply and that the community board is not included in the existing proposal and would need to be considered in a future application.

Linda Losen, Pet Food Express employee, said the goal is to maximize signage.

Suzanne Houston, Property Manager, Sonoma Valley Center LLC, preferred sliding doors over automatic and said the updated design considered Commissioner’s comments.

Chair Tippell closed the item to public comment.

Comm. Barnett thanked the applicant for addressing the concerns and making changes. He has no issue with a sliding door and is only concerned with the parapet. He recommended the sign be attached to the roof or gutter instead.

Comm. McDonald is concerned with the parapet since in his view it is incompatible with the architectural design of the building yet he felt the size is fine.

Comm. Anderson suggested a gable in the element and supported the community board idea.

Comm. Randolph does not support the parapet concept.

Chair Tippell appreciated the revisions made and does not support a parapet with a white background.

Suzanne Houston, Property Manager, requested an approval with modifications for the signage.

Comm. MacDonald made a motion to approve the site plan & architectural review and signs as submitted with the following conditions: 1.) The arcade and tenant signs shall be consistent in size and color with the approved sign program for the shopping center. 2.) The applicant shall return to the DRHPC with additional information related to the Pet Food Express events and community boards. 3.) The applicant shall return to the DRHPC with a revised proposal for the larger roof sign. It was recommended that the revised proposal include an A-frame gable end wall similar to the roof element at Sonoma Market. Comm. Barnett seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

Item #4–Public Hearing-Consideration of external building modifications for a bakery (Scandia Bakery) at 500 West Napa Street, Suite 542

Applicant/Property Owner: Michael Palmer

Associate Planner Atkins presented staff's report.

Michael Palmer, project architect, planned to remove the ATM for more light into the tenant space with no proposed façade changes.

Chair Tippell opened the item to public comment.

Suzanne Houston, Property Manager, said the new window will match existing.

Marcella, Scandia Bakery owner, supported the proposed building modifications.

Chair Tippell closed the item to public comment.

Comm. Barnett made a motion to approve external building modifications for Skandia Bakery. Comm. Randolph seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

Comm. Anderson recused due to proximity and left the room. Christopher Johnson, Alternate at dais.

Item #5-Public Hearing-Continued Design Review- Consideration of design review for three residential units on a mixed-use property at 830 Broadway.

Applicant: Victor Conforti, Architect

Associate Planner Atkins presented staff's report.

Victor Conforti, project architect, altered unit #3 over carport adding a gable element. (noted a correction-lighting fixtures reversed in the staff report).

Comm. McDonald appreciated the changes made and clarified the reasoning for the sliders was to accommodate the bathroom.

Chair Tippell opened the item to public comment.

Diane Merlo, applicant, noted the color changes the Commission requested.

Rich Merlo, brought samples to the Commissioners at the dais for review.

Chair closed the item to public comment.

Comm. Barnett appreciated the applicant and Architect's efforts.

Comms. McDonald, Johnson and Randolph were pleased with the neighborhood support.

Chair Tippell appreciated the applicants responsive to the Commissioners' suggestions.

Comm. McDonald made a motion to approve the application as submitted. Comm. Barnett seconded. The motion carried unanimously. Comm. Anderson recused.

Comm. Anderson returned to the dais.

Item # 6-Public Hearing-Sign Review- Consideration of a temporary sign for a mixed-use building (Williams Sonoma) at 599 Broadway

Applicant: Cindy Treichler/Williams-Sonoma, Inc.

Max Crome, Architect, stated that the sign's purpose is to make the community aware of the estimated opening date for the business (Fall 2014).

Chair Tippell opened the item to public comment.

No public comments.

Chair closed the item to public comment.

Comm. Randolph made a motion to approve the temporary sign for a mixed use building for Williams-Sonoma. Comm. Anderson seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

Comm. Anderson recused due to proximity and left the room. Christopher Johnson, Alternate at dais.

Item # 7-Public Hearing-Sign Review-Consideration of a new monument sign and a wall sign for a commercial building (Flahive Building) at 1051 Broadway

Applicant: Robert Sanders

Robert Sanders, project designer, explained the sign was designed to enhance the façade of the building.

Chair Tippell opened the item to public comment.

No Public Comments.

Chair closed the item to public comment.

All the commissioners supported the design features of the sign.

Comm. Barnett made a motion to approve the new monument sign and wall sign for a commercial building (Flahive Building). Comm. Randolph seconded. The motion carried unanimously. Comm. Anderson recused.

Comm. Anderson returned to the dais.

Comm. Randolph recused due to proximity and left the room. Christopher Johnson, Alternate at dais.

Item # 8-Public Hearing-Design Review of a proposal addition to the residence at 757 Second Street East

Applicant; Suzanne Clark

Suzanne “Zane” Clark, applicant, respected the small home’s features (Carolina Cottage) and believes the system/process will protect the historic integrity. Diane Painter, architectural historian, did the report. The garden is used for non-profit events. All of her neighbors in the back supported the proposal. She met with Planning Director Goodison and Associate Planner Atkins.

Chair Tippell opened the item to public comment.

No Public Comments

Chair closed the item to public comment.

Comm. Barnett commended the homeowner for gaining support from neighbors and local historians.

Comm. McDonald agreed that this is a good example of being “in scale with the neighborhood”.

Comm. Johnson fully supported the addition.

Comm. Anderson is pleased with the sensible design.

Chair Tippell is impressed with the homeowner’s presentation and endorsements from members of the community.

Mary Martinez and Patricia Cullinan local Historical advocates supported the project.

Comm. Barnett made a motion to approve the addition to the residence. Comm. Anderson seconded. The motion carried unanimously. Comm. Randolph recused.

Zane, homeowner, returned to specifically thank Ms. Atkins for her diligence and for being such a pleasure to work with.

Comm. Randolph returned to the dais.

Comm. McDonald recused and left the room for the evening. Christopher Johnson, Alternate, returned to the dais.

Item #9-Public Hearing-Demolition Review- Demolition of the rear portion of a structure on a commercial property at 170 West Napa Street.

Applicant: Michael Marino

Associate Planner Atkins presented staff's report.

Michael Marino, applicant, said that "demolition" was not normally in his vocabulary. He wants to preserve and rehabilitate the structure to use it as a vacation rental or a small scale Inn.

Chair Tippell opened the item to public comment.

No Public Comments.

Chair closed the item to public comment.

Comm. Barnett is of the opinion that it is the highest and best use for the property.

Comms. Johnson and Randolph supported the demolition of the building.

Comm. Anderson frequented the building with past owners and supported the applicant's vision of developing the site with a "village of cottages".

Chair Tippell is very familiar with the site since she works in the building.

Comm. Anderson made a motion to approve the demolition of the rear portion of the structure. Comm. Randolph seconded. The was motion was carried unanimously. Comm. McDonald recused.

Issues Update:

1. The City Council upheld the DRHPC decision for Grandma Linda's Ice Cream Shop.
2. There are 5 applications for DRHPC meeting 4-15
3. Comm. Anderson welcomed Cristina Morris
4. Comm. Barnett thanked Wendy for her dedicated service.

Comments from the Audience: No Public Comments

Comm. Tippell made a motion to adjourn. Comm. Anderson seconded. The motion was carried unanimously.

Adjournment: The meeting adjourned at 10 p.m. to the next regular meeting scheduled for 6:30 p.m. on Thursday, April 15, 2014.

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the foregoing minutes were duly and regularly adopted at a regular meeting of the Design Review and Historic Preservation Commission on the 20th day of May, 2014.

Approved:

Cristina Morris, Administrative Assistant