

**SONOMA VALLEY CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMISSION  
MINUTES OF MEETING JUNE 25, 2014  
SONOMA POLICE DEPARTMENT, COMMUNITY ROOM  
175 FIRST STREET WEST, SONOMA  
6:30 p.m.**

**COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:** Cynthia Wood, Rochelle Campana, Pat Pulvirenti, Jack Ding, Greg Carr, Mark Bramfitt, Kirsten Lindquist, Ken Brown, Bruce Green, Tom Martin, Dick Fogg, Sean Bellach, Ditty Vella, Angela White

**ABSENT:** Clarence Jenkins

1. **Call To Order: 6:30 p.m.**
2. **Minutes Approved of May 28, 2014 Meeting**

Chair Lindquist noted that a presentation originally scheduled for tonight by Sonoma Speedway was cancelled until later in the year at which time they will come before the Commission.

3. **Public Comment: None**
4. **Applicant Name: New Cingular Wireless PCS LLC Resolution**  
**Owner Name: George and Margaret McMahon**  
**Site Address: 8057 Highway 12, Santa Rosa**  
**APN: 051-030-019**

**Request for a Use Permit to allow for an intermediate telecommunications facility to be located within a 60 foot faux water tower and include twelve antennas and associated equipment cabinets on a 2.05 acre parcel.**

**Applicant presentation:**

Jenny Walker, representative for ATT, said this proposal's focus is on two main points: location and design. The location is needed in this area, set back from the Highway 12 corridor at the back of a 2 acre parcel, is minimally visible from the scenic corridor with trees that provide a natural stealthing characteristic, has a willing landlord and fills ATT's service gap coverage in Kenwood because homes, businesses and visitors lack coverage in the area. Several locations were looked at but there were challenges with the topography of area, location next to Highway 12, and a willing landlord to have the facility on their property. In order to fill ATT's objectives and to be least intrusive on community standards, the design will be a 60 ft stealth water tank. It is at tree level, with the lowest overall height, and compatible with the area in a rural setting. There will be no removal of oak trees and natural screening will be maintained. Antennas will be contained within the tower and invisible to the outside. The water tank is superior with a textured, wood-grained design, smaller and less dense to conform to federal regulations and County standards.

**Commissioner questions:**

Ms. Vella: Is this the same proposed faux water tank in October?

Jenny Walker: If it was October, then no.

Pat Gilardi: This is the same applicant but a different project - a new project.

Mr. Bellach: Are there other photos? It's hard to see that a water tower looks like a tower and not like a tree.

Jenny Walker: No other drawings.

Mr. Bellach: What is the increased coverage?

Jenny Walker: There are before and after photos – three or four miles – in building and out building coverage, with significant improved coverage.

Mr. Bellach: Is all equipment inside the tank?

Jenny Walker: It will look like a water tank.

Mr. Green: Re: last presentation – all antennas will be inside. Other 15 carriers have the right to attach to the tower, right?

Jenny Walker: Depends on what their needs are. It's designed for co-location. I can't speculate on the aesthetic look if and when other carriers come.

Mr. Green: Antennas are on the exterior? If 15 carriers require the same amount of antennas for their cell service, can this accommodate 16 carriers inside the tower?

Jenny Walker: We can make accommodations but it depends on what other carriers will need and where they will be on the tower.

Mr. Carr: Under County regulations, they need to provide co-location space. Express them if you have objections to the exterior placement, but when co-location comes after installation, County staff will need to approve the project.

Ms. Pulvirenti: ATT can't restrict just to themselves, right?

Mr. Martin: Least intrusive – is it zoned correctly? The tower meets standard maximum level of exposure.

Jenny Walker: Yes, it's agricultural residential. ATT will emit 3.5% of what FCC allows. There is a third party consultation report on emissions standards.

Mr. Ding: This project is compliant with the FCC but residents nearby are concerned with safety issues. Did you consider residents' concerns?

Jenny Walker: We are in full compliance with the FCC, well below recommended exposure standards. We are open to education if recommended to address residents' concerns.

Mr. Ding: Do you have alternative project if rejected?

Jenny Walker: No, we looked at feasible alternatives. There are many challenges in the area but this meets our needs best and least intrusive. There is no other alternative.

Ms. Wood: How large is the population area of people benefitting?

Jenny Walker: It covers a large area of Kenwood – three or four miles – residents, businesses, wineries. We received welcoming letters due to poor coverage.

Chair Lindquist: Have you reached out to residents most affected?

Jenny Walker: We published a notice and done outreach to people next to parcel.

Mr. Martin: Mr. Woolard said no contact was made from the County or ATT – he has two parcels nearby.

Jenny Walker: We've received positive and negative comments but we sent out notices within a certain radius of the parcel.

Chair Lindquist: My concern is with property values reduced.

Jenny Walker: We've done an extensive evaluation and used third party consultants. Studies show no negative causation but beneficial to businesses, tourists. Property value is not a factor in determination, but overall, no decrease in property value.

Chair Lindquist: If everyone did not want it, what then?

Jenny Walker: It's up to the County. We're in compliance with the FCC and the County.

Ms. Vella: We had an outcry in Sonoma previously?

Mr. Carr: After ATT filed a lawsuit to build a tower on Sebastiani property, it was approved by the City Council.

Chair Lindquist: So your company can sue the County.

Jenny Walker: Legally, local agencies can evaluate our commission and language requirements when a facility is in compliance with the FCC.

**Public questions and comments:**

Rico Martin: I'm curious about cell tower design – if five or 15 carriers come, usually they will redesign the tower. Do you have other designs?

Jenny Walker: The current design meets specifications for locations and what we need now.

**Commissioner comments and discussions:**

Ms. Vella: Given what ATT went through with Sonoma, we're only here to comment on design because we can't say no to the project.

Mr. Carr: We can't deny on radiation or emission issues. If it's visually screened, safe construction, the County will look at alternative sites, co-location opportunities, and other company with co-location. Did ATT pick the best alternative? Is there an agriculturally-zoned parcel that provides the least intrusive option to meet service? Emergency service providers need to have gaps covered – look at more than radiation all around.

Chair Lindquist: Placement is based on what?

Mr. Carr: Land use. One was approved in BHS a year ago, with residents all around. They looked at the need, not where there are lots of people but if service is needed and there are no other options.

Ms. White: Does it meet standards and meet County requirements? More community members should be here.

Ms. Campana: The letters received – those with adjoining properties were against, those further away were for it.

Mr. Bellach: After looking at the alternative site analysis, I will support it, as long as it's not visible and open to others to co-locate if design stays the same.

Ms. White: If there's a more rural setting, not in a neighborhood.

Mr. Bramfitt: Kenwood – there are no pure agricultural sites, there are houses. This is way off the highway.

Mr. Martin: The County has the authority to determine another location if too intrusive. We don't have authority to prove that they meet FCC standards for measurement.

Mr. Carr: Let me clarify – under County regulations, if a company finds a site and there is another site even less intrusive with equivalent coverage then the County would deny the application. Equivalent coverage is most important. No need to put up tower with 50% of power from another tower in the same area. Mark West Springs had an excellent alternative analysis of six different sites. One on an agricultural site was superior to rural residential sites because coverage along roadway was better and more needed by emergency service providers. Least intrusive site is what the County looks for.

Mr. Martin: How to judge that?

Chair Lindquist: Alternative site not included in packet.

Jenny Walker: Alternative site analysis is included in the application.

Mr. Ding: Any project is based on common sense. Housing value not reduced is wrong. We are representatives of our communities – people who lose out should be compensated.

Ms. Campana: I regretted voting for the last proposal. We approved the project – maybe, that's why they didn't come this time because we didn't listen.

Ms. Vella: The landowner is compensated but not the neighbors.

**Motion: Mr. Bramfitt. Approve the application on condition that all future co-location be within structure. Ms. Vella seconded. Motion passed: 9 in favor, 1 opposed (Ms. Campana)**

Ms. Pulvirenti: I would like to make a recommendation to ATT. Put notices to people on telephone poles. You need to reach out more to people, more communication.

Mr. Martin: It is incumbent on the County to notify neighbors of any changes made or construction. People don't get notified in advance.

Mr. Bramfitt: Not true. Notices are sent inside a certain number of feet. Mailings go to property owners, not renters. Then there are always people who say they never received anything.

Mr. Martin: The County has the responsibility to notify of changes in a neighborhood.

Chair Lindquist: Get clarification and bring objections to Supervisor Gorin or Ms. Gilardi.

## **5. Presentation: Sonoma Springs Façade Improvement**

Rico Martin/Rich Image, presented on a project to improve façades of business buildings and bring in customers to the Springs area. Small funds are made available through the County of Sonoma meant to enhance façades and to determine what would be effective for this community. Highway 12 was filmed going in both directions in the Springs and it showed that all the buildings along the 2-mile strip were in the same gray colors. The County wants to dress it up and Mr. Martin states his solution is simple: add more color which can be changed. He provided a few examples: A rundown area in Tucson, Arizona, is now a visual center by just adding beautiful colors; a water tower area in Philadelphia had murals painted on them which attract people passing by, and locally, in Windsor, bright-colored sculptures, unusual lettering, large signage and every building colored differently bring a feeling of activity to the area. In the Springs, he showed a business that went through the program. The owner used a simple painting on a barn wall that drew many customers staying at the Fairmont.

Mr. Martin's own project using these County funds will focus on nine businesses and seven buildings which are far apart. A different solution will be used than the one used in Arizona where all the buildings were clumped together. He discovered that 30,000 cars travel the corridor daily and his intent is to create to visually delight and surprise people with a coordinated design, and make the Springs feel like a community and a destination so that people will want to

participate in the community and the businesses. He showed slides of what can be done to improve the facades of some local businesses such as Plain Jane's and Armando's. Buildings will be a work of art using surfaces and a 1940's style and Hispanic paper cut-out style. What's happening on the inside will be displayed outside and patterns on the buildings and colors used will represent what the business is. He is offering ideas to businesses without a cost and to create a bright, happy, festive feeling. Some ideas he will employ are sculptures in front of some businesses with steel welded together on site then painted, textured paints, transition of colors and colors that blend well together.

**Commissioner comments:**

Mr. Martin: The 10 grants that businesses applied for come through Sonoma County?

Rico Martin: The program is open to everybody within the County. I don't know which they applied for.

Woman in audience: Certain areas have been identified as areas that will benefit from the funds.

Mr. Bellach: How are businesses selected?

Rico Martin: Application through the County and requirements to meet.

Woman in audience: Everyone in the area can apply – the business and building owner must agree because it's a forgivable loan. We need to do outreach to businesses, very few know about it.

Mr. Bellach: Upkeep and maintenance, five years from now?

Rico Martin: I brought my own team together. I have an expert muralist who knows how to treat buildings and materials. Kelly Moore is very interested in the project and their paints have a 7-10 year life, highest quality of donated materials due to low funds. As far as maintenance, graffiti artists stay away as shown in national urban areas. Paints will be UV coated/blocking up to 10 ft high.

Mr. Bellach: Local residents prefer neutral, more conservative colors and many people object to colors. It will be the Springs on acid.

Rico Martin: Susan Gorin has been in support from the beginning. This is a design for businesses to attract attention and far apart from each other. Not all of the Springs will be done this way. We want people to engage and ask questions from both ends and get excited. This is an opportunity to revitalize with little money.

Chair Lindquist: County involvement and approval along the scenic highway?

Rico Martin: I went to PRMD and presented in detail examples of signs, sizing. The County is open and positive and provided ways for me to simplify the process.

Chair Lindquist: The sense of identity.... Sonoma is more conservative, there will be some comments and raised eyebrows.

Rico Martin: I am open to discussing with anybody. This will raise attention to the community, then we can talk about a town center.

Mr. Carr: County Design and Review committee will be involved?

Rico Martin: Design as murals can be repainted. No committee involvement.

Mr. Carr: I love the coloration of buildings, but the signs are gaudy. It's great that area will be rejuvenated.

Rico Martin: It brings people, the community, business people together. It will bring more businesses. The signs are the same size as existing signs.

Mr. Carr: The signage will run into some discussion.

**Public and Commissioner comments:**

Ellen Connelly: I'm part of the Springs Community Alliance and familiar with the program. I'm grateful for the money and designs but some public concerns are pulling back a bit and limiting vibrant colors, it's not sophisticated enough for the Spanish community and has a limited age span. Public feeling is a mix – it's a question of degree.

Patricia Bradley: The Springs is not a place of blight - it's a vibrant place. Coming from Philadelphia, I know what blight is.

Mr. Martin: Highway 12 and the business community – how to present to citizens of the Springs and residents in general?

Rico Martin: Susan Gorin says funds are to redevelop all along the Boyes Hot Springs area. This is the beginning of transforming the area. I describe it as little jewels of color, intended to delight. If it expands, will work with the community and what it wants. In the future, the Springs will be a terminal/station for a train system.

Patricia Connelly: A town hall meeting has been offered.

Rico Martin: We can do that – a community process and project.

**6. Consideration of Items for Future Agenda: None**

**7. Meeting Adjourned: 8:00 p.m.**